

UDC 341.223.2(477.75):327.5(470)
BBC 67.9(4Ukr-6Crm)412+66.4(2Ros)
Z-15

Monograph has been written in the Department of International Law, Institute of International Relations, Taras Shevchenko National University of Kyiv. It has been recommended for publication by the Department meeting of 26 April 2016 (protocol No. 9) and by the Academic Council of the Institute of International Relations, Taras Shevchenko National University of Kyiv on 26 April 2016 (protocol No. 10).

Reviewers:

- Volodymyr Butkevych** — Doctor of Law, Professor, Department of International Law and Comparative Jurisprudence of Kyiv University of Law of the National Academy of Sciences of Ukraine, former Judge of the European Court of Human Rights, deputy head of the Constitutional commission
- Kaminska Natalia** — Doctor of Law, Professor of the Department of Humanities and General Legal Disciplines of the National Academy of Internal Affairs
- Makaruha Zoriana** — Doctor of Law, Head of the Department — Deputy Head of Strategic Planning Department of the Government Office for European Integration of the Cabinet of Ministers of Ukraine

Zadorozhnii, Oleksandr

- Z-15 International Law in the Relations of Ukraine and the Russian Federation: Monograph / Zadorozhnii Oleksandr Viktorovych; Ukrainian Association of International Law, Institute of International Relations, Taras Shevchenko National University of Kyiv, Department of International Law. Kyiv, K.I.S., 2016, 628.

ISBN 978-617-684-146-3

The monograph is the first in the Ukrainian science of international law comprehensive study of trends and problems of application of international law in the Ukrainian-Russian interstate relations throughout the period of their existence. The monograph offers an analysis of key features, issues, trends and patterns of transformation of international legal interaction between Ukraine and Russia at all historical stages and in basic spheres including the forms of their mutual influence. The author identifies features of the treaty framework and institutional mechanisms of regulation of bilateral relations. The international legal positions of Ukraine and Russia in respect of all sensitive issues of relations, starting from Crimea and ending with the problem of delimitation and demarcation of borders, are studied. The author offers an understanding of the problem of applying international law in the Ukrainian-Russian bilateral relations; gives legal qualification of the parties' actions during the interstate conflict between Russia and Ukraine in 2014–2016; summarizes the practice, outlines the drawbacks and provides recommendations regarding the refinement of Ukraine's actions in applying international legal means of responding to the Russian aggression; works out the basic principles of the international legal regulation of Ukrainian-Russian relations upon the end of the conflict and of the application of the rules of international legal responsibility.

The book is intended for everyone interested in contemporary issues in international law.

UDC 341.223.2(477.75):327.5(470)
BBC 67.9(4Ukr-6Crm)412+66.4(2Ros)

ISBN 978-617-684-146-3

© Oleksandr Zadorozhnii, 2015

Contents

List of abbreviations	10
Foreword	14
Chapter I. HISTORIC TRANSFORMATION OF INTERNATIONAL LEGAL INTERACTION BETWEEN UKRAINE AND RUSSIA	21
1.1. Period of formation of Ukrainian-Russian legal relations (4th–16th centuries AD)	23
1.1.1. East Slavic pre-state formations	24
1.1.2. Kievan Rus as a medieval feudal state: structure of the state, interaction between princedoms of Rus and international legal activities	27
1.1.3. Legal relationships between Ukrainian and Russian princedoms after the collapse of Kievan Rus	32
1.2. Bilateral international legal interaction in the period of nation-building (17th–20th centuries)	38
1.2.1. The Hetman state as a “poly-vassal” state formation and the place of the Russian state in its international relations	39
1.2.2. Legal status of Ukraine as a part of the Russian Empire	46
1.3. Period of modern statehood in relations between Ukraine and Russia (20th century)	52
1.3.1. Interstate legal interaction during the Revolution	53
1.3.2. Ukrainian-Russian relationships in the establishment and functioning of the Soviet Union	59
1.4. Conclusions	67

Chapter II. PERIOD OF CRYSTALLIZATION AND ARTICULATION OF INTERNATIONAL LEGAL POSITIONS OF STATES IMMEDIATELY FOLLOWING THE DISSOLUTION OF THE USSR (1991-1997)	71
2.1. International legal formalization of the Russian-Ukrainian state border. Determination of the Crimean peninsula's status as a part of Ukraine	74
2.1.1. Distinguishing the "Crimea issue" in solving the problem of state borders between Ukraine and the Russian Federation	74
2.1.2. Status of the Black Sea Fleet as a destabilizing factor in bilateral interaction in the early years after the dissolution of the USSR	79
2.1.3. The Budapest Memorandum on Security Assurances in connection with Ukraine's accession to the Treaty on the Non-Proliferation of Nuclear Weapons (1994) and its importance for the treaty for legal settlement of the problems of Ukrainian-Russian relations	83
2.2. International legal resolution of the problems regarding the succession of states that were formerly Soviet republics	89
2.2.1. Succession with regard to international treaties	90
2.2.2. Succession in respect of state property, assets and debts	92
2.2.3. Succession with respect to state archives	98
2.2.4. Return of cultural treasures	100
2.3. Establishment of the international legal framework of Russian-Ukrainian interstate cooperation in the economic field	102
2.3.1. Formation of the treaty legal basis for bilateral economic relations	102
2.3.2. Introduction of a national currency in Ukraine, and resistance from the Russian Federation	104
2.3.3. The problem of financial indebtedness and initial attempts to find a legal solution by treaty	105
2.3.4. The 1993 free trade agreement between the governments of Ukraine and the Russian Federation: problematic aspects of its implementation	107
2.3.5. Treaty legal mechanisms for cross-border cooperation	109
2.4. Conclusions	110
Chapter III. PERIOD OF EFFORTS TO ESTABLISH TREATY FRAMEWORK OF RELATIONS AND TO SOLVE THEIR PRINCIPAL PROBLEMS BY INTERNATIONAL LEGAL MEANS (1997-2004)	115
3.1. Treaty of Friendship, Cooperation and Partnership between Ukraine and the Russian Federation (1997)	117

3.1.1. Prerequisites for the Big Treaty	117
3.1.2. The content of the Treaty of Friendship, Cooperation, and Partnership, the key Ukrainian-Russian agreements on the Black Sea Fleet and their significance for the implementation of the strategic partnership concept	119
3.2. The transformation of international legal regulation of Ukrainian-Russian interstate relations in the economic field	124
3.2.1. Development trends of the treaty basis for economic interaction ..	124
3.2.2. Free trade area implementation problems: exemptions from free trade, quotas, and "trade wars"	127
3.2.3. Efforts to involve Ukraine in Russia's economic integration groupings: the Common Economic Space, Eurasian Economic Community, and Customs Union	129
3.2.4. Resolving the problem of debt for energy resources and promoting the idea of a gas transport consortium	132
3.2.5. Implementation of institutional and treaty legal mechanisms for the regulation of cross-border cooperation between Ukrainian and Russian regions	134
3.3. International legal problems of bilateral security cooperation	137
3.3.1. Integration groupings in the security field	137
3.3.2. Russian-Ukrainian relations in the field of the delimitation and demarcation of state borders	140
3.4. Conclusions	146
Chapter IV. PERIOD OF THE MANIFESTATION OF BILATERAL INTERNATIONAL LEGAL INSTRUMENTS' INCONSISTENCY WITH THE NEEDS OF BILATERAL RELATIONS (2005-2010)	149
4.1. The crisis of bilateral international legal instruments to regulate economic cooperation between Ukraine and the Russian Federation	151
4.1.1. Development trends of the legal framework of bilateral cooperation	153
4.1.2. Russian-Ukrainian "gas wars" of 2005-2006 and 2008-2009	154
4.1.3. "Trade wars" and other problems of relations in the field of trade ..	159
4.1.4. Development of cross-border cooperation between the regions of Ukraine and the Russian Federation	161
4.2. International legal problems of bilateral relations between Ukraine and the Russian Federation in the fields of security and formalization of borders in the context of Ukraine's course for Euro-Atlantic integration	164
4.2.1. The development of legal and institutional mechanisms for the integration of Ukraine into NATO, and resistance from Russia ..	164
4.2.2. Resolving the problems of the Black Sea Fleet based on the territory of Ukraine	168

4.2.3. Delimitation and demarcation of borders.....	174
4.3. International legal aspects of Ukrainian-Russian dialogue in the humanitarian field.....	179
4.3.1. Confrontational trends in interstate relations	181
4.3.2. Problems of the return of cultural treasures.....	183
4.4. Conclusions	186
Chapter V. PERIOD OF EFFORTS TO “MODERNIZE” THE INTERNATIONAL LEGAL FRAMEWORK OF RELATIONS (2010–2013)	189
5.1. Kharkiv agreement on Russia’s Black Sea Fleet in Ukraine.....	191
5.1.1. The normative content of the treaty.....	191
5.1.2. Consequences of the agreement for Ukrainian-Russian interstate relations: the problem of Russian Federation’s denunciation of the Kharkiv Pact and Black Sea Accords (1997) ..	193
5.2. Solving international legal problems of formalization of the border between Ukraine and the Russian Federation.....	197
5.2.1. Treaty on the demarcation of the state border (2010) and other bilateral agreements.....	197
5.2.2. Problems of the formalization of maritime spaces.....	199
5.3. International legal problems of deepening economic integration.....	201
5.3.1. Trade restrictions and efforts to involve Ukraine in Russia’s integration groupings.....	201
5.3.2. Russia’s application of means of economic compulsion to impede the conclusion of the Ukraine-European Union Association Agreement	204
5.3.3. Collaborative projects in the economic sphere	207
5.4. International legal aspects of cross-border collaboration between Ukraine and the Russian Federation	209
5.4.1. Agreements on inter-regional and cross-border cooperation and the practice of their implementation	209
5.4.2. Functioning of Ukrainian-Russian Euroregions	211
5.5. Conclusions	215
Chapter VI. THE VIOLATIONS OF THE FUNDAMENTAL PRINCIPLES OF INTERNATIONAL LAW BY RUSSIAN FEDERATION’S AGGRESSIVE WAR AGAINST UKRAINE (SINCE FEBRUARY 2014)	219
6.1. Principles ensuring peace, security and stability in international relations	226
6.1.1. Non-use and non-threat of force	226
6.1.2. Territorial integrity of states	233
6.1.3. Inviolability of European states’ frontiers	240

6.1.4. Peaceful settlement of international disputes.....	243
6.2. Principles protecting human rights, rights of peoples and national minorities.....	248
6.2.1. Equal rights and self-determination of peoples	248
6.2.2. Respect for human rights and fundamental freedoms.....	255
6.3. Principles ensuring effective interaction between states as sovereign and equal subjects of international law	262
6.3.1. Fulfillment of international obligations in good faith	262
6.3.2. Sovereign equality of states	269
6.3.3. Non-interference in the internal affairs of states	273
6.3.4. Cooperation of states	279
6.4. Application of international legal instruments and means of responding to Russian aggression against Ukraine: the implementation of new international legal framework of bilateral interstate relations	282
6.4.1. Solving the problem of the aggressor’s participation in the United Nations Security Council	283
6.4.2. Recognition of the jurisdiction of the International Criminal Court and other international judicial bodies to ensure criminal accountability of persons responsible for the crimes accompanying Russia’s aggression against Ukraine	288
6.4.3. Possibility for adjudicating disputes between Ukraine and Russian Federation by the International Court of Justice.....	292
6.4.4. Recourse to the European Court of Human Rights.....	297
6.4.5. Arbitration process under the United Nations Convention on Law of the Sea 1982.....	305
6.4.6. Recourse of Ukrainian public and private entities to international arbitration procedures for the compensation for material damage done by the Russian Federation.....	309
6.4.7. Application of sanctions to the Russian Federation as a means of bringing to international legal responsibility for the violations of international law	313
6.4.8. General principles of new framework of international legal regulation of relations between Ukraine and the Russian Federation after bringing to international legal responsibility.....	316
6.5. Conclusions	322
General conclusions.....	334
Notes	346